

# Court of Appeals, Division One

## Civil - Family Court

# 1 CA-CV 23-0236 FC

# TIGER v. PENNEL

### Appellate Case Information

Case Filed: 2-May-2023

Case Closed: 12-Jul-2024

Decision

### Dept/Composition

#### Department B

Hon. Michael J Brown  
Hon. Andrew M Jacobs  
Hon. David B Gass

### Side 1. In re the Matter of

MELISSA TIGER, Petitioner/Appellee

(Litigant Group) MELISSA TIGER

- Melissa Tiger

#### Attorney for: Petitioner/Appellee

Christopher Torrenzano, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 36357)

Stephen Roy Smith, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 16030)

### Side 2. MICHAEL PENNEL, Respondent/Appellant

(Litigant Group) MICHAEL PENNEL

- Michael Pennel

#### Attorney for: Respondent/Appellant

Keith Berkshire, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 24107)

Kristi A Reardon, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 27624)

Alexandra Sandlin, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 35564)

### Side 3. The State of Arizona, ex rel. the Department of Economic Security, Intervenor/Appellee

(Litigant Group) The State of Arizona, ex rel. the Department of Economic Security

- State of Arizona

#### Attorneys for: Intervenor/Appellee

Amber E Pershon, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 31042)

### CASE STATUS

Jul 12, 2024.....Case Closed

### PREDECESSOR CASE(S)

MAR FC2021-095515

### Cause/Charge/Class

### Judgment/Sentence

### Judge, Role <Comments>

### Trial

### Dispo

### CASE DECISION

04-Jun-2024 OPINION

Michael Brown.....Author

Andrew Jacobs.....Concur

David Gass.....Concur

Filed: 04-Jun-2024

Mandate: 12-Jul-2024

Decision Disposition

**Reversed in Part**  
**Vacated in Part**  
**Remanded**

### 30 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

- 2-May-2023 FILED: Motion to Docket Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
- 3-May-2023 ORDERED: Motion to Docket Appeal (Appellant) = GRANTED and assigning this appeal case number 1 CA-CV 23-0236. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
- 5-May-2023 RECEIPT No.: 2023-00420 ; \$280.00, Authorization: #25004319370, Applied to: PENNEL - Class A Filing Fee (\$280.00) Paid for: Keith Berkshire - By nCourt LLC
- 18-May-2023 FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries Exhibits: None
- 18-May-2023 FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: Appellant's Fee paid/Appellee's Fee Due/Case Management Statement/Brief Due
- 18-May-2023 FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appea filed in Maricopa County Superior Court on 4/21/23
- 23-May-2023 FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellant)

**Court of Appeals, Division One****Civil - Family Court****1 CA-CV 23-0236 FC****TIGER v. PENNEL****30 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

8.	23-May-2023	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 08/22/2022 - Decree on Demand Hearing (Cathy Kleinbart) (Appellant)
9.	5-Jun-2023	FILED: Notice of Appearance as Co-Counsel for Petitioner/Appellee; Certificate of Service of Notice of Appearance as Co-Counsel for Petitioner/Appellee (Appellee)
10.	9-Jun-2023	RECEIPT No.: 2023-00508 ; \$140.00, Authorization: #60010534391, Applied to: MELISSA TIGER - Class B Filing Fee (\$140.00) Paid for: Fromm Smith & Gadow PC - By nCourt LLC
11.	13-Jun-2023	FILED: State's Notice of Change of Counsel; State's Certificate of Service for Notice of Change of Counsel (Appellee State)
12.	13-Jun-2023	FILED: State's Motion to Change Caption; State's Certificate of Service for its Motion to Change Caption; Attachment A (Appellee State)
13.	15-Jun-2023	FILED: Appellant's Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
14.	29-Jun-2023	ORDERED: State's Motion to Change Caption (Appellee State) = GRANTED. FURTHER ORDERED: Amending the caption in this appeal by adding the State of Arizona, ex rel. the Department of Economic Security as a petitioner/appellee. The caption shown on this order shall be used on all future documents filed in this appeal. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author
15.	25-Jul-2023	FILED: State's Notice of No Brief; Certificate of Service for State's Notice of No Brief (Appellee State)
16.	25-Jul-2023	FILED: Appellee's Answering Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
17.	14-Aug-2023	FILED: Request for Oral Argument; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
18.	14-Aug-2023	FILED: Appellant's Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
19.	18-Aug-2023	ORDERED: Request for Oral Argument (Appellant) = GRANTED. Hon David B Gass - Author
20.	29-Aug-2023	FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days
21.	7-Sep-2023	FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record
22.	26-Sep-2023	CLNDR: MONTHLY COURT CASE CALENDAR, Department B, 11-14-23, 10:15 am, COURTROOM 1.
23.	27-Sep-2023	FILED: Notice of Oral Argument
24.	18-Oct-2023	FILED: Return Receipt for Notice of Oral Argument, signed by Keith Berkshire on 09/27/2023 (Appellant)
25.	23-Oct-2023	FILED: Return Receipt for Notice of Oral Argument, signed by Christopher Torrenzano on 09/27/2023 (Appellee Melissa)
26.	14-Nov-2023	FILED: Sign-in Sheet/Case is Under Advisement as of 11/14/2023
27.	5-Mar-2024	FILED: State's Notice of Change of Counsel; State's Certificate of Service for Notice of Change of Counsel (Appellee State)
28.	4-Jun-2024	OPINION (Reversed in Part, Vacated in Part, Remanded) Hon Michael J Brown - Author; Hon Andrew M Jacobs - Concur; Hon David B Gass - Concur
29.	4-Jun-2024	FILED: Decision Distribution Notification
30.	12-Jul-2024	FILED: Mandate, No physical record to be returned to clerk, Maricopa County Superior Court.